





An Intersectional Visual Analysis of Iranian EFL Textbook of "Vision 2" for Analyzing Visual Representations of

Seyed Mohammad Reza Adel^{1*} 
 Tahmineh Khalili² 

¹Associate Professor of Applied Linguistics, Department of English Language and Literature, Hakim Sabzevari University, Sabzevar, Razavi Khorasan Province, Iran

²Postdoctoral Researcher, Department of English Language and Literature, Hakim Sabzevari University, Sabzevar, Razavi Khorasan Province, Iran

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: 24 October 2023
 Revised: 26 November 2023
 Accepted: 15 February 2024
 Published: 31 March 2024

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR

E-mail: mm12fr@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

English textbooks can be the frontiers of Second Language (L2) and world views for English as Foreign Language (EFL) learners. This qualitative study aimed to uncover how pictures of Iranian-published English textbooks represent identities in terms of gender, race, and nation. To this end, an intersectional lens was employed to analyze the English textbook Vision 2, which was taught in Iranian high school, as the subject of the study. The Visual data were collected and analyzed and the findings obtained by using the models of Nelson (2019) and Zarza (2018) uncovered that Vision 2 could not provide a successful and realistic view of the gender, race, and class for the EFL learners. Insufficient representations of female characters, different races, and nations were the most prominent findings of the present research. This study provided some explanations and suggestions for the following revision of EFL textbooks. In addition, the detrimental consequences of the current approach have been discussed.

KEYWORDS: EFL; Intersectionality; Teaching content; Teaching material

1. Introduction

The intersectionality concept originated in old decades but the term was coined in 1989 by Crenshaw in the U.S. (Crenshaw, 1994). Today, this concept has advanced in other research areas such as Sociology (Choo & Ferree, 2010), Education (Tefera et al., 2018), Medicine (Wilson et al., 2019), Mathematics Education (Bullock, 2018), Chemistry (French et al., 2023), and Psychology (Grzanka et al., 2020). The reason for the importance of studying intersectionality in education in general and in EFL education in particular might be the crucial role of educational materials in shaping learners' thoughts and their subsequent actions and behaviors in response to social and international interactions (Myers, 1997; Reid, & Miller, 1980; Wijayanti et al., 2022).

English textbooks in public education not only clarify the compilers' ideas and their thoughts but they can uncover compilers' intentions for training potential learners and preparing them for their future roles. Although learners usually are not limited to public educational materials for learning fundamental steps and views in socialization and internationalization, EFL materials in public education can play a pivotal role in nurturing social and international views for those who accept public educational materials as the foundation for education. Remembering that the purpose of the educational system has been noted

to prepare individuals for getting social roles and considering the rapid advances in the digital era for studying, working, and living as an international citizen, this study tried to shed light on the untouched aspect of intersectionality in Iranian public education. In sum, educational systems are not responsible for teaching basic knowledge to individuals but they have to utilize broader views to train people for a peaceful and collaborative version of social and international lifestyles. Further, the collection of Vision has been one of the revised versions of EFL education in public education in Iran, so the contribution of this study can play a role for educational policy-makers, material developers, and course designers. In addition, EFL teachers might find this study, interesting and relevant to their professions.

2. Literature review

Textbook analysis has been recognized as one of the key lines of research in ELT. In recent decades and studies on textbook analysis and visual analysis have increased (Gulya & Fehérvári, 2023; Hamid, 2022; Sleeter, & Grant, 2017; Ullah, & Skelton, 2013) and some of them are reviewed in this section.

2.1. Visual textbook analysis

Mulcahy and Samuels (1987) in their study of illustrations over three hundred years in the U.S. published textbooks discussed that pictorial aspects of textbooks can resemble the graphical arts of ancient caves i.e. both of these examples aimed at interacting through pictures. Based on their study, hieroglyphics, Chinese scripts, and TV commercials were also in the categorization of visual interactions. The main contribution of pictures in educational materials such as textbooks has been notified as the learning facilitators (Chen et al., 2019; Hafiz, & Anisa, 2022). This critical contribution does not seem to be replaced by other things in all kinds of textbooks either ELT or other subjects (Nisak et al., 2021). Further, Masur (1998) pointed to the use of superficial pictures as the inevitable aspect of textbooks for the ease of meaning-making. Continuing this line of research, Stylianidou (2002) confirmed that visual aspects of textbooks not only facilitate understanding but can also facilitate teachers' tasks in teaching. From cognitive, affective, and motivational psychology, Lenzner et al. (2013) noticed students' attention, motivation, and affective aspects in response to pictures in textbooks. According to their findings, when students had a low level of background knowledge in a given part, pictures could help students to compensate in the learning process. In recent years, Derakhshan (2024) studied and discussed on the importance of visual aspects of textbooks and noted that issues such as culture seem to be part of Iranian EFL textbooks. Thus, examining textbooks in terms of different semiotic approaches seems to be critical for updating textbooks. This line of research still seems to have great potential for investigation.

2.2. Gender representations in textbooks

Searching in the studies of gender representation in textbooks uncovered that the main motive for such studies has been recognized as providing an equal opportunity for both genders to obtain social roles in their societies (Blumberg, 2008). Prior studies have shown that women were presented with the role of mother in EFL textbooks which can display that textbooks were not representative of the real world (Otlowski, 2003). Since pictorial aspects of textbooks can be "memorable", this part of education deserves high attention and expertise works (Levin, & Mayer, 2012).

To review some of the relevant literature, Law, and Chen (2004) in their analysis of textbooks in Hong Kong observed that textbooks preserved the stereotypes of genders. In the subsequent research, Good et al. (2010) advanced beyond recognition of stereotypes of gender textbooks and suggestions. They could also predict how these gender stereotypes can endanger female social roles and statuses. In the following study, Foroutan (2012) also examined how genders were presented in Iranian textbooks in terms of socialization theory for understanding the educational system and materials. Based on his study, the representation of genders in textbooks can influence gender socialization. He also identified that male and female stereotypes were observed hierarchically in the textbooks. In the next study, Sovič and Hus (2015) studied textbooks for the gender stereotype and reported that they could observe that although the material and contents were adapted for young learners' cognitive system, the male characters were presented more in comparison with female characters in the textbooks. In the following international research, Islam and Asadullah (2018) also checked textbooks published by Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani, and Bangladeshi educational systems and confirmed that textbooks were not impartial in terms of gender in the educational context. In the following study, Lestariyana et al. (2020) checked gender roles in Indonesian ELT textbooks and reported that the stereotypes of genders were presented in the textbook thus; they suggested that considering the role of textbooks in transforming values for the next generations, it might be very determinative to consider gender equality and possible bias in compiling textbooks. In the next research, Hosseini Ahmadabadi and Azad (2023) tried to analyze ELT textbooks in Iran with an EFL teachers' lens. The main focus of their study was on the representation of gender and gender pedagogical effects. Having conducted a survey and semi-structured interview with 330 male and female EFL teachers, they reported that male characters had a significant role in the contents represented in the textbook. They also reported that EFL teachers believed that the inequality observed in the gender roles of the textbooks can influence students' future social roles

either in education or in vocation. As noted above gender stereotypes cannot be linked to one context thus the study of gender bias and stereotypes seems to have a contribution beyond local settings.

Despite many attempts to analyze Iranian textbooks in general (Seddighi et al., 2021; Zarei, & Hossein Nia, 2023) and English textbooks in particular (Rashidi & Kehtarfard, 2014), there are still aspects of textbooks which need investigation. This study examined how intersectionality might be considered in the pictures of English textbooks in Iran. The main point that differentiates the present study from the previous ones such as Hosseini Ahmadabadi and Azad (2023) might be the concentration on pictorial aspects of EFL textbooks, as the part of the textbook that can catch students' attention even before the reading phase. The crucial impression caused by textbook pictures was one of the key motivations for selecting this aspect of textbooks (Kasmaienezhadfad et al., 2015). Textbook pictures can shape students' meaning of learning, creativity process, imaginary assumption, motivation, stable learning facilitator, and homogenizing society (Kasmaienezhadfad et al., 2015; Perlmutter, 1997; Yasar, & Seremet, 2007). Considering the mentioned issues, Iranian textbooks seem not to be sought for intersectionality in the presented pictures. In addition, EFL textbooks as the compulsory part of general and public education would be taught at every kind of education at the high-school levels (even at skill-based education), thus, the importance of EFL textbooks can go beyond what might be assumed. Regardless of the possibility of English language use for students' future occupations, pictures of EFL textbooks can influence students' cognitive systems for a long time if not lifelong.

Rezki and Yassine (2024) compared gender representation in two different EFL textbooks i.e., Algerian EFL textbook "At the Crossroads" and the French EFL textbook "Let's Meet Up". They used a multimodal analysis for different sections of images, grammar, and visual designs. According to their findings, male characters were used in both EFL textbooks more than female characters. In addition, male characters had more prominent roles than female characters. Based on their conclusion, the Algerian EFL textbook "At the Crossroads" and the French EFL textbook "Let's Meet Up" could not provide a condition for gender equality in the visual aspects of the textbooks while textbooks were published in two different countries and systems. Collectively, such studies imply revisions and improvements of textbooks, policies, and subsequently views in real life.

2.3. Race representation in textbooks

Race has been noted as one of the critical variables in analyzing textbooks, because textbooks cannot be seen as a bank of information but rather, they convey messages for teachers and students (Smith, 2024). Considering the influences of pictures in textbooks, pictures depicted in the textbooks have been studied in different fields such as Mathematics (Pohle et al., 2024). According to Pohle et al. (2024), probably, one of the most prominent effects of neglecting race in the visual aspects of textbooks might be noted in the problematic stereotypes in professions and social role acceptance.

Another instance of focusing on race in visual aspects of textbooks was carried out for the History textbooks in the U.S. (Lewis & Crowley, 2024). The investigation of the History textbooks uncovered that the neglected groups (people of color in this case) were also neglected from their social benefits (Lewis & Crowley, 2024). As it seems, the negative consequences of a lack of consideration for visual aspects of race in textbooks can lead to problems in social and even economic policies. The current literature on intersectionality can uncover how race representations were neglected in the research aspects of EFL research and teachings therefore identifying gaps and filling the gaps need to be followed in the Iranian EFL setting.

2.4. Nation representation in textbooks

The emphasis on the critical role of involving other nations and introducing their culture seems to be pivotal in L2 education (Javed, & Atta, 2024). One of the advantages of representing different nations in the textbooks might be identifying variables in different cultures and learners' own cultures (Astaiji & El Allame, 2024; Khoeriah et al., 2024). In addition, the representation of nations in EFL textbooks can shape learners' ideologies (Shah, 2023). In this regard, Durma (2023) checked the variable of the nation in the History textbooks of Germany, Spain, and Turkey. Based on her findings, representations of pictures were in line with the views that the countries were interested in such as dominance, policies, and economics.

After notifying the importance of adding nations into EFL textbooks, it is also considerable to mention why it is a pitfall for not involving other nations in the EFL textbooks. One of the detrimental consequences of lack of consideration in adding other nations to foreign language education might be lack of developing intercultural for the learners (Sadeghzadegan et al., 2024).

3. Methodology

3.1. Analytical framework

The emphasis on the critical role of involving other nations and introducing their culture seems to be pivotal in L2 education (Javed, & Atta, 2024). One of the advantages of representing different nations in the textbooks might be identifying variables

in different cultures and learners' own cultures (Astaifi & El Allame, 2024; Khoeriah et al., 2024). In addition, the representation of nations in EFL textbooks can shape learners' ideologies (Shah, 2023). In this regard, Durna (2023) checked the variable of the nation in the History textbooks of Germany, Spain, and Turkey. Based on her findings, representations of pictures were in line with the views that the countries were interested in such as dominance, policies, and economics.

After notifying the importance of adding nations into EFL textbooks, it is also considerable to mention why it is a pitfall for not involving other nations in the EFL textbooks. One of the detrimental consequences of lack of consideration in adding other nations to foreign language education might be lack of developing intercultural for the learners (Sadeghzadegan, et al., 2024).

3.2. Method

This textbook analysis used the models of Nelson (2019), and Zarza (2018) for the visual content analysis of the textbook of Vision 2 for analyzing textbooks' representation of gender, race, and nation, of identities in pictures of individuals in public English textbooks published for high school students in Iran. Vision 2 met the required criteria of this study: 1) it was the nationally published textbook taught in both public and private schools in Iran, and 2) it had pictures and illustrations of people. Table 1 presents the preliminary features of Vision 2.

Table 1. Data Source: Vision 2 preliminary features

| No. | Title | Page analysis |
|-----|----------|---|
| 1 | Vision 2 | Total pages= 110 Pages with photo/ illustrations of people= 37 Analyzed pictures=51 |

As Table 1 reports, the raw data of this study (51 pictures) were collected from 37 pages in which the illustration of human beings was presented either in the form of real photos of individuals or in the format of drawing and painting. The raw data was classified based on the variables of the investigation i.e., gender, race, and class. To this end, the pictures were saved into electronic forms with brief explanations for subsequent categorizations. Another issue for categorizing the pictures was the consideration of pictures captions but it became apparent that pictures in the English textbooks lacked captions for additional information. In other words, the pictures were used as the instructional facilitator and decorating pages therefore, the book compilers seem to assume that no caption was needed.

One of the authors coded the pictures and then the coded tables were double-checked by other assistant experts. After examination and classification of the pictures, 51 Pictures were selected for the final analysis based on the models of Nelson (2019), and Zarza (2018). The software of M.S. Excel was used for the data classification; summarization and analysis (see the Appendix section). The coding table was checked and analyzed based on the research questions, variables, and the purpose of the study. The results obtained from the analyzing models are presented in the subsequent section.

4. Results

In the analysis stage, it became apparent that among 51 pictures, only one picture encompassed characters of both genders male and female. Table 2 reports gender distribution in textbook pictures.

Table 2. Gender distribution in Vision 2 pictures

| Genders in a picture | Number of pictures | Percent (%) |
|----------------------|--------------------|-------------|
| M & F | 1 | 1.96 |
| Male | 37 | 72.54 |
| Female | 13 | 25.49 |
| Total | 51 | 100 |

As shown in Table 2, males were the dominant characters in the visual analysis of Vision 2. Table 3 focused on the alphabetical order of the races shown in Vision 2.

Table 3. Race distribution in Vision 2 pictures

| Race in a picture | Number of pictures | Percent |
|-------------------|--------------------|---------|
| African American | 2 | 3.92 |
| American | 2 | 3.92 |
| Asian | 45 | 88.23 |
| European | 2 | 3.92 |
| Total | 51 | 100 |

Table 4 displays the distribution of nations in the pictures of Vision 2.

Table 4. Nation distribution in Vision 2

| Nation representation in a picture | Number of pictures | Percent |
|------------------------------------|--------------------|---------|
| African American | 2 | 3.92 |
| American | 1 | 1.96 |
| Arabian | 1 | 1.96 |
| European | 2 | 3.92 |
| Iranian | 45 | 88.23 |
| Total | 51 | 100 |

The qualitative analysis of the visual aspects of Vision 2 uncovered that Vision 2 emphasized the role of men, the Iranian race, and the nation.

5. Discussion

The findings could verify that revised Iranian EFL textbooks still focused on male and national race and nation. In other words, Iranian EFL textbooks were used to expand EFL learners' interests in their nation and culture. The obtained results could be similar results in the studies conducted by Sadeghzadegan et al. (2024) who also admitted the traditional views in Iranian EFL textbooks. The results were also similar to Phuong and Vanderstraeten (2024) who noted the emphasis on National Identity in EFL textbooks. Such similarity might be linked to the war experiences of the two countries Iran and Vietnam and the considerations of their territory. While these findings can trigger solutions for following revisions of the textbooks, it seems vital to check and examine EFL textbooks' content and visual aspects with experts. The key question of such view might be "Why do EFL learners need to study English?" if the answer is to communicate with other nations, races, and genders thus those groups should be added to the EFL textbooks' visual and content parts. Another assumption for interpreting this result might be preserving young generations from being attracted by Western culture and possibly preventing future brain drain. While it is worth noting that brain drain can have other reasons, the scope of this study does not discuss further on this aspect.

One of the possible reasons for achieving these results might be the stabilized traditional views on women's role in social life despite the revolutionized status of women in comparison with past eras. Another possible explanation for the findings might be the lack of opportunity for interacting with other nations. If there were a considerable number of international communications with diverse nations and races, there might be considerations into the chance of such interactions and thus adding the pictures of diverse groups in Vision 2. While there are many chances to watch different nations and races on social media these days, it seems necessary to add representations for less-attended groups in the EFL textbooks. Another possible explanation for the current status might be dealing with the conservative approach to teaching and learning Western languages and culture that has been followed by the authorities in Iran (Orakcı & Khalili, 2024). Such an approach could lead to preventing the use of Western's (or other nations' and races') elements. Since this approach cannot provide a real picture of the world for the EFL learners; this approach seems to need revisions based on the EFL learners' needs.

The main contribution of this study might be uncovering how people may see the English language, English language learning, and individuals of other nations. The findings of this study can also clarify how Iranian English textbooks looked and taught globalized views in EFL education. Probably, this study might emphasize that EFL education should not be regarded as training in grammar, vocabulary, and written aspects of the English language. In other words, learning a new language necessitates considering the target language and global cultures, and more importantly the latest educational trends (Khalili, & Adel, 2024; 2023a & 2023b).

Although the relevant theories of this study were discussed above, this study can be linked to the other theories. In other words, since the case of gender in the intersectionality theory can be linked to feminist studies, this study can be linked to Feminist Theory as well. The main role of Feminist theory has been noted to be providing equity and equal opportunity for

women in social settings. Textbooks can play a significant role in shaping equal social roles for women. Female students can accept that they have authority over their personal lives to create promotional opportunities for themselves while male students can accept the beneficial role of women in their societies. Thus, no one can assume that education has been seen as the end of individuals' social lives, but it is the starting point for advancing in sciences and jobs (Knudsen, 2006).

One of the main contributions of this study was reminding which groups were neglected in the EFL textbooks and need to be considered in future revisions of the present draft. As there have been revisions for the present textbooks, the promising approach of the Ministry of Education in improving textbooks might be another positive part of this study.

6. Conclusion

Having analyzed the visual aspect of Vision 2, this study will suggest remedies for coping with such as condition. Reminding the absence of minorities in Vision 2 can clarify that the revised version of Vision 2 might be more productive by adding neglected groups of Gender, Race, and Nation. Advancing to the new era of education necessitates consistent analysis and revisions in educational materials, training courses, teachers' educations, and teaching and learning trends (Smith, 2024). This study reminded us that without considering all groups in the visual aspects of EFL textbooks, setting for success in different aspects of human social life might not be possible.

One of the limitations of this research was the focus on one textbook which impeded concentration on other textbooks in Iran, either in English or in other subjects. Another limitation of this research was the focus on just the visual aspects of the textbook thus, this study could not check the contents noted in the textbook. Since this study checked a limited scope of intersectionality in English textbooks, the finding of generalizability needs caution. Further, this study checked Iranian-published English textbooks thus this study failed to add possible comparisons and contrasts.

Suggestions for further research can focus on textbook analysis in terms of both content analysis and visual analysis to provide a comprehensive perspective of the textbook materials. In addition, scholars can examine if textbooks of other subjects (other than English) have considered intersectionality in their fields. Future studies can focus concentrate on comparative research between Iranian and other nations' published English textbooks to provide a more realistic view of Iranian textbooks.

The implications of this study are related to educational policy-makers, course designers, task developers, teacher trainers, and material developers. Considering the emotional aspects of education can pave the way for developing more peaceful, bright, and collaborative societies and countries. Moreover, investing in nurturing besides educating can facilitate international collaboration and scientific advancements.

7. Acknowledgement

The authors would like to express their appreciation' to anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments.

8. Declaration of conflict of interests

The authors report there are no competing interests to declare.

9. Funding details

This research was supported by the Hakim Sabzevari University Postdoctoral grants. [Grant number 1401/8/57523].

10. References

- Astaifi, H., & El Allame, Y. E. K. (2024). The Representation of Culture in Moroccan EFL Textbooks: An Investigation of Reading Texts. *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature mand Translation*, 7(2), 18-28. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2024.7.2.3>
- Berger, J., Blomberg, S., Fox, C., Dibb, M., & Hollis, R. (1973). *Ways of Seeing*. Penguin Books Limited: Great Britain.
- Blumberg, R. L. (2008). The invisible obstacle to educational equality: Gender bias in textbooks. *Prospects*, 38, 345-361. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-009-9086-1>
- Braveman, P., & Parker Dominguez, T. (2021). Abandon "race." Focus on racism. *Frontiers in Public Health*, 9, <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2021.689462>

- Bullock, E. C. (2018). Intersectional analysis in critical mathematics education research: A response to figure hiding. *Review of Research in Education*, 42(1), 122-145. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X18759039>
- Chen, X., de Goes, L. F., Treagust, D. F., & Eilks, I. (2019). An analysis of the visual representation of redox reactions in secondary chemistry textbooks from different Chinese communities. *Education Sciences*, 9(1), 42. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci9010042>
- Choo, H. Y., & Ferree, M. M. (2010). Practicing intersectionality in sociological research: A critical analysis of inclusions, interactions, and institutions in the study of inequalities. *Sociological Theory*, 28(2), 129-149. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9558.2010.01370.x>
- Crenshaw, K. (1994). *Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory, and antiracist politics*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429499142-5>
- Derakhshan, A. (2024). ‘Should textbook images be merely decorative?’: Cultural representations in the Iranian EFL national textbook from the semiotic approach perspective. *Language Teaching Research*, 28(1), 79-113. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168821992264>
- Durna, F. (2023). “Minorities”, the nation and Europe in the history textbooks of Germany, Spain and Turkey. *Turkish History Education Journal*, 13(1), 1-28. <https://doi.org/10.17497/tuhed.1329347>
- Foroutan, Y. (2012). Gender representation in school textbooks in Iran: The place of languages. *Current Sociology*, 60(6), 771-787. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011392112459744>
- French, A. M., Else-Quest, N. M., Asher, M., Thoman, D. B., Smith, J. L., Hyde, J. S., & Harackiewicz, J. M. (2023). An Intersectional Application of Expectancy-Value Theory in an Undergraduate Chemistry Course. *Psychology of Women Quarterly*, 47(3), 299-319. <https://doi.org/10.1177/03616843231153390>
- Good, J. J., Woodzicka, J. A., & Wingfield, L. C. (2010). The effects of gender stereotypic and counter-stereotypic textbook images on science performance. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 150(2), 132-147. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224540903366552>
- Grzanka, P. R., Flores, M. J., VanDaalen, R. A., & Velez, G. (2020). Intersectionality in psychology: Translational science for social justice [Editorial]. *Translational Issues in Psychological Science*, 6(4), 304-313. <https://doi.org/10.1037/tps0000276>
- Gulya, N., & Fehérvári, A. (2023). Addressing disability representation in EFL textbooks used in Hungarian public education. *International Journal of Educational Research Open*, 4, 100226. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2023.100226>
- Hafiz, M., & Anisa, Y. (2022). Improving Early Childhood Counting Ability Through Modification of Illustrated Counting Books. *Sensei International Journal of Education and Linguistics*, 2(1), 128-140. <https://doi.org/10.53768/sijel.v2i1.74>
- Hamid, M. O. (2022). World Englishes, secularisation, and de-secularisation: examining English language textbooks in a Muslim society from the perspective of language as situated practice. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2022.2159419>
- Hosseini Ahmadabadi, Z. S., & Azad, M. (2023). The Analysis of EFL Teachers’ Attitudes on ELT Textbooks in Iran: The Case of Gender Representation and its Pedagogical Effects. *Journal of Foreign Language Research*, 13(2), 317-334. <https://doi.org/10.22059/jflr.2023.356924.1024>
- Islam, K. M. M., & Asadullah, M. N. (2018). Gender stereotypes and education: A comparative content analysis of Malaysian, Indonesian, Pakistani and Bangladeshi school textbooks. *PloS one*, 13(1), e0190807. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0190807>
- Javed, Z., & Atta, A. (2024). Representation of Multicultural Values through Images in Educational Textbooks: A Semiotic Analysis. *Jahan-e-Tahqeeq*, 7(1), 81-97.

- Kasmaienezhadfadard, S., Pourrajab, M., & Rabbani, M. (2015). Effects of pictures in textbooks on students' creativity. *Multi-Disciplinary Edu Global Quest (Quarterly)*, 4(2), 83-96.
- Khalili, T., & Adel, S. M. R. (2024). Exploring the Impact of Intersectionality on Second Language Teacher Recruitment. *11th International and the 17th National Conference on E-Learning and E-Teaching Focusing on Technology Enhanced Learning*. 27-29 Feb. University of Isfahan, Iran.
- Khalili, T., & Adel, S. M. R. (2023a). Intersectionality in Second Language Education and the Birth of a New Term. *Applied Research on English Language*, 12(2), 133-154.
- Khalili, T., & Adel, S. M. R. (2023b). Using English Animations for Decreasing Intersectionality and Increasing Success. *Conference of New Media Pedagogy: research trends, methodological challenges and successful implementations*. 2023/11/23, Kraków, Poland.
- Khoeriah, A., Hidayat, D. N., Alek, A., & Mulyati, Y. F. (2024). The cultural representation in EFL textbook of merdeka curriculum. *Jurnal Info Sains: Informatika dan Sains*, 14(01), 348-359.
- Knudsen, S. V. (2006). Intersectionality—A theoretical inspiration in the analysis of minority cultures and identities in textbooks. *Caught in the Web or Lost in the Textbook*, 53(1), 61-76.
- Law, K. W. K., & Chan, A. H. (2004). Gender role stereotyping in Hong Kong's primary school Chinese language subject textbooks. *Asian journal of women's studies*, 10(1), 49-69. <https://doi.org/10.1080/12259276.2004.11665965>
- Lenzner, A., Schnotz, W., & Müller, A. (2013). The role of decorative pictures in learning. *Instructional Science*, 41, 811-831. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11251-012-9256-z>
- Lestariyana, R. P. D., Widodo, H. P., & Sulistiyo, U. (2020). Female representation in governmentmandated English Language textbooks used in Indonesian Junior High Schools. *Sexuality & Culture*, 24(4), 1150-1166. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-020-09752-2>
- Levin, J. R., & Mayer, R. E. (2012). Understanding illustrations in text. In *Learning from textbooks* (pp. 95-113). Routledge.
- Lewis, B., & Crowley, R. M. (2024). "If they were white and middle class": The possessive investment in whiteness in US History textbooks' portrayal of 20th-century social democratic reforms. *Theory & Research in Social Education*, 52(1), 97-120. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2023.2226093>
- Masur, L. P. (1998). " Pictures have now become a necessity": The use of images in American history textbooks. *The Journal of American History*, 84(4), 1409-1424. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2568088>
- Mulcahy, P., & Samuels, S. J. (1987). Three hundred years of illustrations in American textbooks. In *The Psychology of Illustration: Volume 2: Instructional Issues* (pp. 152). New York, NY: Springer US.
- Myers, G. (1997). Words and pictures in a biology textbook. *Functional approaches to written text: Classroom applications*, 93-104.
- Nelson, J. (2019). *"I thought Canadians were white!": an intersectional gendered visual analysis of race, nation, gender, and LGBT+ representation in ESL/ELL textbooks* (Doctoral dissertation, University of British Columbia).
- Nisak, N. M., Arifin, M. B. U. B., Fahyuni, E. F., & Rahmawati, I. M. (2021). The Development of Comic Formatted Fiqh Textbook for Islamic Elementary School. *European Journal of Education Studies*, 8(1).
- Orakçı, Ş., & Khalili, T. (2024). Iranian and Turkish EFL instructors' critical Openness, reflective Skepticism, innovative thinking and accountability: A comparative study. *Heliyon*. 10 (7). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e29097>
- Otlowski, M. (2003). Ethnic diversity and gender bias in EFL textbooks. *Asian EFL Journal*, 5(2), 1-15.
- Perlmutter, D. D. (1997). Manufacturing visions of society and history in textbooks. *Journal of Communication*, 47(3), 68-81.

- Phuong, T. D., & Vanderstraeten, R. (2024). National Identity and National Territory. In *The 'Hidden Curriculum' of Vietnam's English School Textbooks* (pp. 21-45). Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore.
- Pohle, E., Marzocchi, A., Di Pasqua, A., & Rumaldo, E. (2024). An Investigation of How Humans are Portrayed in High School Mathematics Textbooks. *Teaching for Excellence and Equity in Mathematics*, 15(1).
- Rashidi, N., & Kehtarfarid, R. (2014). A Needs Analysis Approach to the Evaluation of Iranian Third-Grade High School English Textbook. *SAGE Open*, 4(3). <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244014551709>
- Reid, D. J., & Miller, G. J. A. (1980). Pupils' perception of biological pictures and its implications for readability studies of biology textbooks. *Journal of Biological Education*, 14(1), 59-69. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00219266.1980.9654288>
- Rezki, K., & Yassine, S. (2024). Multimodal Analysis of Gender Representation in EFL Textbooks (At the Crossroads and Let's Meet Up). *العمدة في اللسانيات وتحليل الخطاب*, 8(1), 16-38.
- Sadeghzadegan, M., Mohammadi, M., & Baradaran, A. (2024). A Content Analysis of Multicultural Representations of Textbooks in Expanding Circle Countries: A Case of Vision Series in Iran. *Journal of Applied Linguistics Studies*, 3(2), 18-31.
- Seddighi, H., Sajjadi, H., Yousefzadeh, S., López, M. L., Vameghi, M., Rafiey, H., & Khankeh, H. R. (2021). Representation of disasters in school textbooks for children with intellectual disabilities in Iran: a qualitative content analysis. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 53. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijdr.2020.101987>
- Shah, W. A. (2023). Nation, alterity and competing discourses: Rethinking textbooks as ideological apparatuses. *Linguistics and Education*, 78, 101250. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.linged.2023.101250>
- Sleeter, C. E., & Grant, C. A. (2017). Race, class, gender, and disability in current textbooks. In *The politics of the textbook* (pp. 78-110). Routledge.
- Smith, P. S. (2024). (Re) presenting race: an analysis of special education textbooks for engagement with race and ethnicity. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13613324.2024.2306409>
- Sovič, A., & Hus, V. (2015). Gender stereotype analysis of the textbooks for young learners. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 186, 495-501. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.080>
- Stylianiidou, F. (2002). Analysis of science textbook pictures about energy and pupils' readings of them. *International Journal of Science Education*, 24(3), 257-283. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500690110078905>
- Tefera, A. A., Powers, J. M., & Fischman, G. E. (2018). Intersectionality in education: A conceptual aspiration and research imperative. *Review of research in education*, 42(1), vii xvii. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X18768504>
- Ullah, H., & Skelton, C. (2013). Gender representation in the public sector schools textbooks of Pakistan. *Educational Studies*, 39 (2), 183-194. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2012.702892>
- Wijayanti, F., Miqawati, A. H., & Al Mujib, I. H. (2022, February). Revealing Gender Bias on ELT Textbook: A Critical Discourse Analysis. In *2nd International Conference on Social Science, Humanity and Public Health (ICOSHIP 2021)* (pp. 158-161). Atlantis Press.
- Wilson, Y., White, A., Jefferson, A., & Danis, M. (2019). Intersectionality in clinical medicine: the need for a conceptual framework. *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 19(2), 8-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15265161.2018.1557275>
- Yasar, O., & Seremet, M. (2007). A comparative analysis regarding pictures included in secondary school geography textbooks taught in Turkey. *International Research in Geographical & Environmental Education*, 16(2), 157-188. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2167/irgee216.0>
- Zarei, E., & Hossein Nia, R. (2023). Analysis of High School Chemistry Textbooks Used in Iran for Representations of Nature of Science. *Interchange*, 54(2), 253-270. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10780-023-09490-y>

Zarza, J. A. (2018). *Representations of feminist theory and gender issues in introductory-level sociology textbooks* (Doctoral dissertation, Portland State University).

11. Appendix

Data classification and summarization of individuals' pictures in Vision 2

| No | Picture ID | Lesson | Page | Gender | Race (American Indian or Alaska Native, Asian, Black or African American, Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander, & White) | Nation | Activity in picture |
|----|------------|--------|------|--------|---|--------|---------------------|
|----|------------|--------|------|--------|---|--------|---------------------|